Prove It! From Oral Argument to Written Argumentation

Marlene Carter
Dorsey High School, Los Angeles Unified
UCLA Writing Project
Demands and Requirements

Teachers juggle demands from
• State standards
• District
• School: school-wide and grade level
• Parents
• Ourselves
What is non-negotiable?

- What are the things that must happen in my classroom?
- What content must be included?
- What skills must I teach my students?
The question many teachers ask…

How can I add content and skills that I find important when I already have so many demands to fulfill?
Including argumentation allows students to

• think critically
• improve reading skills
• develop speaking skills
• develop listening skills
• improve writing skills
Argumentation

- teaches a life skill
- engages students in topics they enjoy discussing
Paired Role Play

• Students pick partners.
• The topic should be accessible to all.
• Each person has a minute to speak.
• Teenagers:
  – More freedom
  – Alleviate stress from parents
  – Transportation to work
  – Run errands for parent
  – Parent won’t have to get up so early

• Parent Counter Arguments
  – I didn’t get a car
  – Who will pay?
  – Don’t want to get in an accident
  – Research—16-year-old brains
  – Couldn’t take care of hamster
  – 4000 lb killing machine
  – Insurance cost

• Teen Response
  – Get a job
  – Anyone can get in accident
  – Driving class
Spar

Variations include

• half the class versus the other half
• the whole class versus the teacher
• two students versus two other students
• one student versus one student
Spar Time Limits

• 1 minute   Affirmative
• 1 minute   Negative
• 3 minutes  Clash
• 1 minute   Negative
• 1 minute   Affirmative
Racial Profiling Notes

Affirmative

• We have to give up some freedom in order to be safe

• Law enforcement needs to use profiling to narrow the number of suspects

• Not using profiling would cause many more innocent people to be inconvenienced at the airport.
Racial Profiling Notes

Negative

• We are less safe if racial profiling is used.

• Profiling makes innocent people want to retaliate against the police.

• It doesn’t work. (42,00 stops in NY. Only 10,00 arrests = 32,000 innocent people stopped by the police)
Racial Profiling Notes

- Makes innocent people feel insecure
- Allows criminals who don’t fit the profile to get away
- At the airport, unfairly invades the privacy of innocent people